# March 19, 2024
# Mid-Atlantic SSC Meeting:

## OFL CV Sub-Group Update

*John Boreman, Sarah Gaichas, Tom Miller,*

*Mike Wilberg, Olaf Jensen, Brandon Muffley,*

*Paul Rago*

**MID-ATLANTIC** | FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# OFL CV Sub-Group – Background

- Tasked with reviewing and suggesting edits to OFL CV guidance document last revised in 2020
  - Reviewed SSC comments from 2021-2023, previous SSC OFL CV decisions from 2017-2023, and recent research findings

- Sub-group met on three occasions (Nov. 6, Jan. 12, Feb. 27)
  - Results of those meetings are summarized on the SSC Google Drive:
    - Draft OFL CV guidance document with initial suggested edits
    - OFL CV sub-group background document – additional detail and context to suggested edits
    - All sub-group meeting notes and meeting information.

MID-ATLANTIC
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# OFL CV Sub-Group – Today's Objectives

- Provide feedback to OFL CV sub-group on guidance document edits and recommendations
  - Support/or not for sub-group recommendations
- Primary recommendation topics:
  1. OFL CV Bins
  2. Dropping Criteria
  3. Criteria Tiering
- Discuss next steps

MID-ATLANTIC
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# Draft Recommendations – 1. OFL CV Bins

- Are current OFL CV bins (60, 100, 150) still appropriate or are changes needed?

- Review of existing and new analyses looking at stock assessment uncertainty in region, across county, and world

- Empirical and theoretical information suggests 60% OFL CV may be overly optimistic

- Recommendation: no change to current bins at this time, but include new/stronger information regarding current MAFMC SSC bins and 100% OFL CV is default

MID-ATLANTIC
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# Draft Recommendations – 2. Dropping Criteria

- Are existing 9 criteria informative, clearly defined, and/or needed?

- Reviewed previous SSC comments and application of each criterion in overall application/determination of OFL CV value

- <u>Recommendation:</u> drop 3 existing criteria for explicit consideration
  - Criterion #7 – Informed by prediction error
    - Outdated analysis. Relies on comparable baseline models; cannot be used when model changes (e.g., ASAP to WHAM) or data time series are revised (e.g., new MRIP). Future project?
  - Criterion #8 – Assessment accuracy under different fishing pressures
    - Confusing to interpret and may create perverse incentives
  - Criterion #9 – Informed by simulation analyses or full MSE
    - Minimally used to by SSC and minimally available to date

- As needed/available, any of these deleted criteria could be considered by SSC within remaining criteria

**MID-ATLANTIC**
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# Draft Recommendations – 3. Criteria Tiering

- Are there ways to make the process more efficient and streamlined while retaining the deliberative, transparent, and open approach?

- Reviewed existing criteria and application over time – some criteria have more "weight" than others in determining final OFL CV value

- Recommendation: establish a 2-tiered criteria process
  - Tier 1 – data quality, model appropriateness and identification, and informed by retrospective analysis
  - Tier 2 – estimates informed by comparison with empirical/experimental analyses, informed by ecosystem factors, informed by appropriate stanzas in recruitment
  - Tier 1 criteria evaluated first and would set floor for overall OFL CV value
  - Quantitative scoring still not ready or appropriate for primetime.

MID-ATLANTIC
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL

# Next Steps

- Sub-group scheduled to meet April 30<sup>th</sup>
  - Address SSC feedback and finalize recommended edits/updates to guidance document
  - Develop recommendations for "other tasks" assigned to sub-group
    - Short-term ABC projection assumptions
    - ABC review/check-ins
    - Status quo/interim ABC recommendations
- Full SSC to review and approve edits to draft guidance document and "other task" recommendations
- Council will review and approve SSC recommendations at June Council meeting
- SSC to use new OFL CV process at July meeting when making ABC recommendations

MID-ATLANTIC
FISHERY MANAGEMENT COUNCIL