# Summer flounder 2023 Management Track Assessment 

## NOAA

 FISHERIES- NEFSC
- Paralichthys dentatus
- June 2023


## Summer flounder 2018 SAW 66 Most recent 'Benchmark’ assessment

SARC-66 concluded that the summer flounder stock was not overfished nor did it experience overfishing in 2017. The Review Panel concluded that "...the SAW WG had reasonably and satisfactorily completed its tasks."

Estimates of recreational catch came from newly calibrated MRIP timeseries that reflected a revision of both the intercept and effort surveys.

The Bigelow indices ('SSQ’) took into account trawl efficiency at length.
No factor was identified as strongly influencing the spatial shift to the northeast in spawner biomass or the recent below average recruitment.

The assessment showed that recent mortality from all sources was greater than recent recruitment inputs to the stock, resulting in a declining stock trend.

## Recent Updates

Data Updates in 2019 and 2020
All Fishery Catch and Catch-at-age
All Surveys
SSC made no changes to OFLs/ABCs
Management Track Assessment (MTA) in 2021
Analysis: NFT ASAP SCAA, AGEPRO Projection YPR/SSBR BRP models
Not Overfished and No Overfishing
'Minor' retrospective; no adjustment
Consistent with 2018 SAW 66 Benchmark
SSC accepted projections for
OFLs/ABCs in 2022-2023

## 2023 Management Track Assessment Data and modeling overview

- Add 2020-2022 fishery and research survey data to the 2018 SAW 66 / 2021 MTA assessment model
- Update mean weight and maturity averages for BRPs and projections
- Update BRPs
- Evaluate stock status relative to updated BRPs
- Conduct projections for 2024-2025 to determine OFLs
- Level 2 Management Track review
- CAMS 2020-2022 commercial fishery catch data
- BIG Indices to 'AS'; minor model setting changes (input CVs, ESSs)
- Test additional terminal selection block (2008+ to 2016+)
- Extend last 9 recruitments to last 12 recruitments for projections
- Backup - Examination of aggregate survey trends or PlanBsmooth using NEFSC BIG survey trends to project trend of catch


## TOR 1: Fishery Catch

1. Estimate catch from all sources including landings and discards

## Commercial Landings

Comm. Landings: MA to NC, out to edge of shelf NEFSC Weighout/AA through 2019, GARFO CAMS 2020-2022

Mainly a mixed trawl fishery (>90\% of landings)
Avg. $\sim 10,000 \mathrm{mt}(22$ million lb) for 1955-60
Avg. < 5,000 mt (11 million lb) for 1968-72
Avg. ~13,000 mt (29 million lb) for 1974-87

Under quotas, avg. 5,600 mt (12 million lb) for 1993-2017
2018: 2,787 mt ( 6.1 million lb); 93\% of CQ
2019: 4,109 mt ( 9.1 million lb); 83\% of CQ
2020: 4,282 mt ( 9.1 million lb); 82\% of CQ
2021: 4,936 mt ( 10.9 million lb); $87 \%$ of CQ
2022: $5,683 \mathrm{mt}(12.5$ million lb); $81 \%$ of CQ

## Commercial Discards

- SBRM Estimator through 2019; CAMS Estimator 2020-2022;
- 80\% mortality rate
- During 1993-2017: 1,100 mt = about 20\% of comm landings

$$
\begin{array}{lr}
\text { 2018: } & 979 \mathrm{mt}=35 \% \text { of comm landings } \\
\text { 2019: } & 783 \mathrm{mt}=19 \% \text { of comm landings } \\
\text { 2020: } & 1,163 \mathrm{mt}=27 \% \text { of comm landings } \\
\text { 2021: } & 873 \mathrm{mt}=18 \% \text { of comm landings } \\
\text { 2022: } & 680 \mathrm{mt}=12 \% \text { of comm landings }
\end{array}
$$

## Commercial Discards

|  | SBRM | CAMS | C-S | $\%$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2018 | 979 | 1183 | +204 | $+21 \%$ |
| 2019 | 783 | 892 | +109 | $+14 \%$ |
| 2020 | 816 | 1163 | +347 | $+43 \%$ |
| 2021 | 940 | 873 | -67 | $-7 \%$ |

## Recreational Landings

Uses 'New MRIP’
Avg. ~9,200 mt (20 million lb) for 1981-1992
Under limits, avg. 7,300 mt (16 million lb) for 1993-2017

2018: 3,447 mt ( 6 million lb); 172\% of RHL 2019: 3,537 mt ( 9 million lb); 102\% of RHL 2020: 4,571 mt (10 million lb); 131\% of RHL 2021: 3,092 mt ( 7 million lb); 82\% of RHL 2022: 3,916 mt ( 9 million lb); 83\% of RHL

## Recreational Discards

Uses 'New MRIP'
10\% mortality rate
Avg. ~450 mt (1 million lb) for 1981-1992
Under limits, avg. 1,600 mt (4 million lb) for 1993-2017
2018: 1,003 mt ( 2 million lb), 29\% of recr landings
2019: 1,379 mt ( 3 million lb), 39\% of recr landings
2020: 1,141 mt ( 3 million lb), 25\% of recr landings
2021: 997 mt ( 2 million lb), 32\% of recr landings
2022: 1,336 mt ( 3 million lb), 34\% of recr landings


## TOR 2: Indices of abundance

2. Evaluate indices used in the assessment (e.g., indices of relative or absolute abundance, recruitment, state surveys, age-length data, etc.)

## Research Surveys

- NEFSC Winter 1992-2007, Fall and Spring 1967-2022 (no Fall 2017 or 2020)
- MADMF Spring and Fall 1978-2022, Seine YOY 1982-2022
- RIDFW Fall 1981-2022, Monthly Fixed Station 1990-2022
- URIGSO Narragansett Bay/RI Sound 1959-2022
- CTDEP Spring and Fall 1984-2022
- NYDEC Peconic Bay 1987-2022
- NJDFW Apr-Oct 1988-2022
- DEDFW 16 ft Estuary YOY 1980-2022, 16 ft Inland Bays YOY 1986-2022, 30 ft Mainstem Bay Trawl 1991-2022
- MDDNR YOY 1972-2022
- VIMS Juv. Trawl YOY 1955-2022
- VIMS ChesMMAP 2002-2022
- VIMS NEAMAP Fall and Spring 2007-2022
- NCDMF YOY 1987-2022
- NEFSC MARMAP 1978-1986 and ECOMON 1999-2015 Larval indices of SSB

NEFSC Spring ALB


NEFSC Fall ALB


NEFSC Fall BIG


## NEFSC Larval Surveys



## MA Trawl Surveys



## RI Trawl Surveys



## CT and NY Trawl Surveys



NJ and DE Trawl Surveys


## ChesMMAP and NEAMAP Trawl Surveys



## NEFSC Fall Age 0 Indices



MA and RI Age 0 Indices


## CT, NY and NJ Age 0 Indices



## DE Age 0 Indices



MD, VIMS and NC Age 0 Indices


## ChesMMAP and NEAMAP Age 0 Indices



## Summer flounder (Paralichthys dentatus) Life History

- Biological data from NEFSC survey and fishery samples
- Over last ~decade: more large, old fish Transition from scales to otoliths for all aging Current maximum ages of 18 and 20 for males (50,57 cm) and 19 (73, 79 cm ) for females
- Over last ~decade:
- decreasing mean length and weight at age for both sexes
- decreasing maturity, largest impact for age 1
- changing sex ratio at age as $F$ has decreased and stabilized: convergence to $1: 1$ even for larger/older ( $>60 \mathrm{~cm} / 5+$ ) fish;
i.e., more males at larger/older fish


## Summer flounder Total Catch Mean Weights at Age



NEFSC Fall Survey: 3-yr window


## NEFSC Spring Survey Sample Data

Proportion Females at Age


## NEFSC Spring Survey Sample Data

Proportion Females at Age


NEFSC Spring Survey Sample Data
Proportion Females at Age


## TOR 3: Estimate F, R, and SSB

- 3. Estimate annual fishing mortality, recruitment and stock biomass (both total and spawning stock) as possible (depending on the assessment method) for the time series using the approved assessment method and estimate their uncertainty. Include retrospective analyses if possible (both historical and within-model) to allow a comparison with previous assessment results and projections, and to examine model fit.
a. Include bridge runs to sequentially document each change from the previously accepted model to the updated model proposed for this peer review.
b. Prepare a backup assessment approach that would serve as an alternative for providing scientific advice to management if the analytical assessment were to not pass review


## 2023 Management Track Assessment ASAP Model thru 2022

- NEFSC NFT ASAP Statistical Catch at Age Model
- $\mathbf{M}$ at ages $\mathbf{0 - 7 +}$ (model ages 1-8+); variable $\mathbf{M}$ at age average $=0.25$
- Weights at age for Catch and SSB; recent decreases
- Maturity at age: 3 year moving window ~70\% age 1, 100\% age 2+
- Recently variable from $\sim 50 \%$ to $\sim 80 \%$ at age 1
- Four fleets - Landings and Discards (Com L, Com D, Rec L, Rec D)
- Several federal and state surveys with age comp indices
- Several stand-alone YOY indices
- A few aggregate indices of abundance
- SV selex modeled with at-age estimation; constant over full time series
- Fishery selex modeled with at-age estimation: 3 time blocks 1982, 1995, 2008; Landings selex with S = 1 at true age 2-4; discards at true age 1-3;


## Summer flounder 2023 MTA ASAP Model Development

- 1) Comparison of 2021 MTA model using BIG sweep-study efficiency and average tow swept area (SSQ) to BIG efficiency and individual tow area swept (AS): very minor effect on indices and model





## Summer flounder 2023 MTA ASAP Model Development

- 2) Comparison of 2023 MTA model using 2021 input SV CVs to updated SV CVs based on diagnostics (OLDSET vs NEWSET)
- Inflate input CVs of a few survey indices (CT spring, NM fall, BIG fall; minor improvement in diagnostics and minor estimation effect in terminal years)





## Summer flounder 2023 MTA ASAP Model Development

- 3) From 2023 MTA model NEWSET, re-center input catch and survey input ESSs (NEWSET_ESS): minor improvement in diagnostics, minor estimation effect in terminal years, moved forward with NEWSET_ESS





## Summer flounder 2023 MTA ASAP Model Development

4) From 2023 MTA model NEWSET_ESS, test split of terminal fishery selectivity block from 2008-2022 to 2008-2015, 2016-2022

- Resulted in larger maximum gradient (i.e., less robust model fit) - 0.004 increased to 0.012
- Did not result in obviously changed/improved fishery catch at age residuals
- Shifted/create some 'doming' in selex back into the 2008-2015 time block; terminal block still relatively flat
- Minimal change in SSB and F
- Largest selex effects occurred for true ages 6, 7+
- Retrospective pattern changes were variable:
- F: $+3 \%$ to -8\%; 'worse'
- SSB: +6\% to +4\%; 'better'
- R: +28\% to +17\%; 'better'
- Total N: +16\% to +9\%: ‘better’

Ultimately did not change, retaining one longer time block ( 15 years), versus two borderline 'too short' blocks (8 years, 7 years), for this model with 8 age classes

Fleet 1 (COMMLAND)


Fleet 1 (COMMLAND)


Fleet 2 (COMMDISC)


Fleet 2 (COMMDISC)


Fleet 3 (RECLAND)


Fleet 3 (RECLAND)


Fleet 4 (RECDISC)


Fleet 4 (RECDISC)






## Summer flounder 2023 MTA Final ASAP Model

- 'Internal' Retrospective: minor at +6\% for SSB and +3\% for F
- Jitter: 98 of 100 converged, all at same Objective Function value
- MCMC: no convergence problems or unusual high correlations, relatively precise estimates (terminal year CVs = ~15\%)
- Internal Estimation of BRPs not sufficient: estimated steepness (h) = 1, used proxies instead (F35\% = FMSY)
- Final model: F2023_NEWSET_ESS_V1

Fleet 1 (COMMLAND)


Fleet 3 (RECLAND)


Fleet 2 (COMMDISC)


Fleet 4 (RECDISC)


Average F Ages 5-5 Unweighted


Rho = + $\mathbf{3 \%}$


Spawning Stock Biomass


Rho $=+6 \%$


Stock Numbers Age 1
Standard


Rho = +28\%




Year

## 2023 Management Track Assessment ASAP Model

Comparative results 2008 to 2023 models

ASAP Assessments 2008-2023


ASAP Assessments 2008-2023


## ASAP Assessments 2008-2023



## TOR 4: BRPs and Status

4. Re-estimate or update the BRP's as defined by the management track level and recommend stock status. Also, provide qualitative descriptions of stock status based on simple indicators/metrics (e.g., age- and sizestructure, temporal trends in population size or recruitment indices, etc.).

- 2021 Management Track Assessment: through 2019
- Recruitment sampled from 1982-2019: avg $=53$ million
- BMSY = SSB35\% = 55,217 mt
- $F M S Y=F 35 \%=0.422$
- MSY = 15,872 mt = 34.992 mlb
- Not Overfished: SSB2019 = 47,397 mt, 86\% of BMSY
- Not Overfishing: F2019 = 0.340, 81\% of FMSY
- 2023 Management Track Assessment: through 2022
- Recruitment sampled from 1982-2022; avg $=51$ million
- BMSY = SSB35\% = 49,561 mt
- $F M S Y=F 35 \%=0.451$
- $M S Y=14,097 \mathrm{mt}=31.079 \mathrm{mlb}$
- Not Overfished: SSB2022 = 40,994 mt, 83\% of BMSY
- Overfishing is occurring: F2022 = 0.464, 103\% of FMSY





## TOR 4: Qualitative status

- The age structure in current fishery and survey catches is greatly expanded compared to the truncated distribution observed in the late 1980s to early 1990s - indicates mortality has been sufficiently low to allow rebuilding of age structure (2018 SAW 66)
- Most aggregate SV indices have declined since about 2010
- Although survey indices and model estimates of recruitment have generally been below average in recent years, the driver of this pattern has not been identified and it is not clear if this pattern will persist in the future (2018 SAW 66)


## TOR 5: Projections

5. Conduct short-term stock projections when appropriate.

## 2023 Management Track Assessment OFL Projections 2024-2025

- Projections for 2024-2025 OFLs at FMSY $=\mathbf{0 . 4 5 1}$
- During 2018-2022, an average of $96 \%$ of the ABC was caught; assume 2023 ABC caught $=15,023 \mathrm{mt}$
- Recruitment sampled from 2011-2022; avg = 36 million
- OFL 2024 = 10,422 mt (CV = 16\%)
- OFL 2025 = 10,839 mt (CV = 11\%)
- Subsequent MAFMC SSC, MC, and Staff recommendations will determine OFLs/ABCs under the risk policy and any other options


## TOR 6: Respond to any review panel comments or SSC concerns from the most recent prior research or management track assessment.

## 2018 SAW 66

- Continue to explore changes in the distribution of recruitment. Develop studies, sampling programs, or analyses to better understand how and why these changes are occurring, and the implications to stock productivity: no new research progress; ongoing monitoring through assessment
- The reference points are internally consistent with the current assessment. It may be useful to carry uncertainty estimates through all the components of the assessment, BRPs, and projections: no new research progress; both 'internal' and 'external' models of S-R data continue to indicate that steepness is very close to 1 ; latter point will be addressed when model transitions to NEFSC WHAM state-space model in next RTA
- Explore the potential mechanisms for recent slower growth that is observed in both sexes: no new research progress; ongoing monitoring through assessment; some literature on climate effects on distribution, growth, and M (O'Leary et al. 2019 a,b)


## TOR 6: Respond to any review panel comments or SSC concerns from the most recent prior research or management track assessment.

## MAFMC SSC 2019-2022

- Evaluate the causes of decreased recruitment and changes in the recruit per spawner relationship in recent years: no new research progress; however the R/SSB ratio has stabilized as the stock has varied near BMSY
- Evaluate uncertainties in biomass to determine potential modifications to the OFL CV employed: SSC has developed new procedures for establishing the OFL CV
- Evaluate fully the sex and size distributions of landed and discarded fish in the Summer Flounder fisheries: no progress in implementing by-sex fishery sampling
- Evaluate the effects of past and possible future changes to size regulations on retention and selectivity in stock assessments and projections: ongoing monitoring in assessment; test 2016+ selectivity block, but retained 2018+ selectivity block
- Incorporate sex-specific differences in size-at-age into the stock assessment through model structures as well as data streams: no new data streams; however ASAP by-sex model updated through 2021 and NEFSC WHAM state-space by-sex model in development


## TOR 6: Respond to any review panel comments or SSC concerns from the most recent prior research or management track assessment.

## MAFMC SSC 2019-2022

- Validate the otolith-based age determination: no explicit validation, however, going aging method exchanges have ensured consistency among the major aging labs (NEFSC, NCDMF, VIMS, ODU, CTDEEP, and NYDEC)
- Further develop understanding of effects of ecosystem changes (e.g., temperature, trophic structure changes) on population dynamics: new publications in the primary literature (O'Leary et al. 2019 a, b (Nye lab); Gulf Stream Index and exploitation influences on growth and natural mortality)
- The MAFMC SSC expressed some concern in 2020 that the rebuilding of the stock does appear to be rapid. It was noted that rebuilding was predicted to be slow under the harvest policy adopted: updated projections through 2025 in the 2023 MTA


## TOR 6: Respond to any review panel comments or SSC concerns from the most recent prior research or management track assessment.

MAFMC SSC 2019-2022

- The above average 2018 year class will not fully recruit to the fishery for 3 or 4 years (20212022). There are concerns about increasing discards during this transition. Quantify the size, magnitude, and uncertainty of the discards: updated estimates of discards through 2022 in the 2023 MTA; no large increase in discards evident through 2022
- Verifying the strength of the 2018 year class based on a synthesis of the various surveys included in the assessment. (3 years of data on this year class will be available): based on surveys indices and assessment model estimates through 2022, the 2018 year class was initially overestimated, with a current model retrospective error (7 'peels' for 2015-2022) of +28\%; the 2021 MTA initial estimate of the 2018 year class at 61 million age 0 fish has been revised downward to 43 million fish in the current 2023 MTA
- Understand the objectives and performance measures for the fishery from a socioeconomic perspective, to evaluate the balance of costs and benefits of ABC specifications. Reconsider stock structure based on modern approaches: an MSE for the recreational fishery was completed in 2023 to partially address these concerns. No further research on stock structure has been initiated to date


# TOR 3b: <br> Backup - Aggregate Survey Trends (plots) and/or <br> PlanBsmooth trend (cod/monkfish model) 

- PlanBsmooth:
- NEFSC Spring and Fall surveys
- Use only 2009-2022 series in BIG units (no calibration, sweep q at length, individual tow wing spread, using 'Blaylock' SAS code)
- Note: omit Fall 2017, Spring and Fall 2020 (no interpolation)
- 'Average Multiplier’ = 0.867
- So, use 0.867 as 'Multiplier’ for future OFL
- Example: future 2024-2025 OFL/ABCs is ~87\% of current 2023 OFL/ABC
- Relationship of OFL to ABC will depend on SSC application of riskpolicy and assumption for OFL CV under Backup Plan

Fluke BIGSV AS Spring
Multiplier $=0.99$


Fluke BIGSV AS Fall
Multiplier $=0.808$


Fluke BIGSV AS Spring and Fall
Multiplier $=0.867$


